Presentation to: International Dairy Foods Association

"The Science and Politics of Dietary Fat"





Nina Teicholz

Investigative science journalist Author, *The Big Fat Surprise*



Professor (Adjunct), New York University, Health Policy & Management Executive Director, The Nutrition Coalition "A gripping narrative" that should be read researchers, clinicians and healthcare providers." —The Lancet

"Impressive . . This book shook me. . . Teicholz has done a remarkable job" The BMJ (British Medical Journal)

- "A page-turner...a nutrition thriller" The Economist
- "A Best Book of the year"

Wall Street Journal ,
Mother Jones, Forbes,
Times of London, BBC Food,
The Economist









Loren Cordain, Ph.D.

I came to this without any preconceptions

- A vegetarian for 25+ years
- From Berkeley, CA
- Moved to NYC
- A journalist
- Undertook nearly **10** years of research



18 years,, 145 lbs

Disclosure:

I receive **no industry support** of any kind - not for my book or any subsequent research/work.

Current Diet Recommendations



Sources: USDA for Food Guide Pyramid, Harvard School of Public Health for Med Diet Pyramid.

Mediterranean Pyramid



FIG. 2. Fat Louisa.



We need to explain this:



How it All Started







Source: CDC data

What causes heart disease?

- Vitamin deficiency
- Type A Personality
- Auto Exhaust

Source: Mann, George V., "Diet and Coronary Heart Disease." *Archives of Internal Medicine* 104 (1959): 921–929, 922.

...And smoking!





Eisenhower was a chain smoker - 4 packs a day Americans Had Become Smokers

Ancel Keys' "Diet-heart hypothesis"





1961: The American Heart Association



First advice anywhere in the world to limit saturated fats and cholesterol in order to prevent heart disease



The original, natural fats





Tallow

Suet





Lard



Butter

Oils used as lubricants for machinery in industrial revolution









Margarine









Vegetable cooking oils







Animal fats vs. Vegetable fats Consumption Change in the 20th century



Source: USDA



Ancel Keys was "Mr. Cholesterol"

The most influential nutrition scientist of the 20th century

1961:

American Heart Association recommends polyunsaturated oil to fight heart disease



What Was the Evidence??



What Keys submitted as evidence



What Keys didn't submit as evidence



Other problems with the 7 Country Study

- While Keys *did* find that although saturated fats seemed linked to heart disease....there was no difference in *total* mortality
- Dietary data was sampled from < 500 men out of 12,970, or *less than 4%*

Studying the islanders on Crete.... who were long-lived



....during Lent



"The Greek Orthodox fast is a strict one and means abstaining from all foods of animal origin, including fish, cheese, eggs and butter" —Contemporary Observer

Outsized impact of the Cretans

- Only 30-33 men
- Yet this data convinced Walter Willett, founder of the "Mediterranean Diet"
- Now Co-Commissioner of EAT-Lancet, telling everyone to go vegan....based on *this* Cretan data.





EAT Lancet Report According to the report, you can eat 8 tsp of sugar but only 1 cup whole milk

Mediterranean Pyramid

Ultimate problem:

The 7 Countries Study was an epidemiological study

Can show **association**... but not establish **causation**

Inevitability of False Positives

Divorce rate in Maine

 \equiv

correlates with

Per capita consumption of margarine

Correlation: 99.26% (r=0.992558)



Inevitability of False Positives



Scientists knew this was weak evidence....


So governments around the world undertook randomized controlled clinical trials (the "gold standard")

- There were actually a large number of governmentfunded, randomized, controlled clinical trials
- On "hard endpoints"
- On altogether more than **25,000** men and women, in experiments lasting 1 to 12 years
- RESULTS: No effect of saturated fats on cardiovascular mortality or total mortality

Source: Teicholz, N, BMJ 2015

Yes, these diets reduced cholesterol...

► Usually by around 13%

But this reduction in cholesterol had no effect on cardiovascular mortality

The diet-heart hypothesis is the most tested hypothesis in the history of nutrition and disease

And the results were null

And in nearly a dozen of these studies...



L.A. Veterans Trial

Editors, "Diet and Atherosclerosis" 1969, 940

Oslo study Leren 1966, 88

"MRFIT" Trial

NIH-funded

Multiple Risk Factor Intervention Trial Research Group, Journal of the American Medical Association, 1982

L.A. Veterans Trial—risk of cancer



The Politics of Nutrition Science



NIH National Heart, Lung, and Blood Institute





Learn and Live



American Heart Association Monograph Number Eighteen

> Namesat Deer-Beart Store terrane Care COMMUTER ON DED

Publication supported by Research Grant H-6007 IT & Public Health Service National Beart Institute

The National

Final Report

Diet-Heart Study

THE AMERICAN NEART ASSOCIATION, INC., NEW YORK

Silencing the critics: George Mann



George Mann Vanderbilt University





Selection Bias: the Minnesota Coronary Survey

American Arteriosclerosis, Heart Association-Thrombosis, and Vascular Biology JOURNAL OF THE AMERICAN HEART ASSOCIATION Test of effect of lipid lowering by diet on cardiovascular risk. The Minnesota Coronary Survey. 1 D Frantz, Jr, E A Dawson, P L Ashman, L C Gatewood, G E Bartsch, K Kuba and E R Brewer Arterioscler Thromb Vasc Biol. 1989;9:129-135 GOI: 10.1.10./01.1.4.1 V.9.1.1.429 Arteriosclerosts, Thrombosis, and Vascular Biology is published by the American Heart Association, 7272 Greenville Avenue, Dallas, TX 5223 Avenue, Dallas, 1X 75251 Copyright © 1989 American Heart Association, Inc. All rights reserved. Print ISSN: 1079-5642. Online ISSN: 1524-4636 The online version of this article, along with updated information and services, is located on the http://atvb.ahajournals.org/content/9/1/129 Permissions: Requests for permissions to reproduce figures, tables, or portions of articles originally published in Arteriotechronis, Throughouts, and Faccular Biology can be obtained via RightLink, a service of the Copyright Demance Concern to the Editorial Office. Once the online version of the published article for which permission Clearance Center, not the Editorial Uffice. Unce the online version of the published attack for which permassion is being requested is located, click Request Permissions in the middle column of the Web page under Services Further information about this process is available in the Permissions and Rights Question and Answerdecument. Reprints: Information about reprints can be found online at: Subscriptions: Information about subscribing to Arteriosclerosis, Thrombosis, and Vascular Biology is online at: http://atvb.ahajournals.org//subscriptions/

The BMJ 2015: The more the men lowered their cholesterol, the more likely they were to die from cardiovascular death.



US Dietary Goals



Bachrach/Getty Images

Senator George McGovern



Source: US Dept of Agriculture

Rate of Overweight/Obesity in US



Source: CDC data

Isn't it all our fault?

People don't follow the **Dietary Guidelines** faithfully enough





People exercise too little

AMERICANS <u>HAVE</u> FOLLOWED THE US DIETARY GUIDELINES



NOTES: The latests data on animal fats and vegetable oils are reported from 2010, not 2014; Food consumption (food availability minus loss) is also

Major macronutrient shift in US 1965-2011



Source: Cohen et. al., Nutrition, 2015, volume 31, Issue 5, 727-732

Yes, we eat more calories, but...

Americans eat more calories, and all of those calories are from carbohydrates



Source: Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, "Trends in Intake of Energy and Macronutrients --- United States, 1971-2000," MMWR Weekly, February 6, 2004 / 53(04);80-82; Chart by Nina Teicholz.

On exercise...

"...physical activity is generally insufficient by itself to bring about clinically significant weight loss...a dietary intervention is usually needed"

Physical Activity Guidelines Advisory Committee Report, U.S. Office of Disease Prevention and Health Promotion, 2008

"sedentary behavior cannot be shown to lead to obesity."

Report by the 2015 Dietary Guidelines Advisory Committee

Conclusion:

You can't exercise your way out of a bad diet



Maybe it's not our fault after all...

Maybe its' the fault of the Dietary Guidelines themselves...

What does the science now say?

#1: Saturated fats do NOT cause CVD death

Now >16 meta-analyses and systematic reviews looking at link between saturated fats and heart disease.

Taken together, these conclude that saturated fats:
– Are not associated with heart disease
– Have no effect on cardiovascular mortality

Canadian



The following recommendations do not include a threshold or limit for saturated fat

https://www.heartandstroke.ca/-/media/pdf-files/ canada/position-statement/saturatedfat-eng-final.ashx

RECOMMENDATIONS

The science of nutrition is ever-evolving with new evidence emerging all the time. It is becoming increasingly clear that what has the most impact on health is the overall quality of one's diet, combined with the types and quantity of food consumed. The following recommendations do not include a threshold or limit for saturated fat and instead focus on a healthy balanced dietary pattern, which can help Canadians reduce consumption of saturated fats.

The Heart and Stroke Foundation recommends that:

CANADIANS

- 1. Eat a healthy balanced diet.
 - Consume a variaty of patural/whole and minimally.

"We're all **afraid** of saturated fat, but saturated fat actually appears **good** for you."

Salim Yusuf, Chair, Dept. of Cardiovascular Disease,. McMasters University Medical School

Home Journals Specialties The Lancet Clinic Global Health Multimedia Campaigns
THE LANCET
Online First Current Issue All Issues Special Issues Multimedia - Information for Authors
All Content Search Advanced Search
< Previous Article Volume 390, No. 10107, p2050-2062, 4 November 2017 Next Article >
Articles
Associations of fats and carbohydrate intake with
cardiovascular disease and mortality in 18 countries from five
continents (PURE): a prospective cohort study
Dr Mahshid Dehghan, PhD 🖻 🖂, Andrew Mente, PhD, Xiaohe Zhang, MSc, Sumathi Swaminathan, PhD, Prof Wei Li, PhD,
Prof Viswanathan Mohan, MD, Romaina Iqbal, PhD, Prof Rajesh Kumar, MD, Edelweiss Wentzel-Viljoen, PhD, Prof Annika Rosengren, MD, Leela Itty Amma, MD, Prof Alvaro Avezum, MD, Jephat Chifamba, DPhil, Rafael Diaz, MD, Rasha Khatib,
PhD, Prof Scott Lear, PhD, Prof Patricio Lopez-Jaramillo, MD, Xiaoyun Liu, PhD, Prof Rajeev Gupta, MD, Noushin

Paradigm change on saturated fats?

THE LANCET Perspectives

Book

Fat and heart disease: challenging the dogma

cholesterol are bad for you, you'll be Many voices were raised against the few key opinion leaders. Promises of incensed. If you think the fat story is interpretation of the Seven Countries massive funding, together with a lack exaggerated, you'll be incensed. If you Study, Dissent, however, was barely of rigorous evaluation of the strength tust in the objectivity of science to tolerated and Teicholz describes how of the evidence, seem to have resulted informhealth policy, you'l be incensed. the discussions degenerated into in entrenched positions on detary fat Stories of shocking scientific corruption personal attacks. Teicholz explains intake. On the basis of epidemiological and o/pability by government agencies how this came about in the second data, but ignoring the evidence from are all to be found in Nina Teicholz's half of the 20th century. direct scientific interventions with

has shaped our lives for decades.

scientists. Despite the increasing the need to challenge dogma... The Big Fat Surprise is a gripping number of retracted papers, society

heart disease.

much data from one country). Such that reviewers are not likely to look personal ambition. Furthermore, limitations would make this study objectively at results that disagree with in providing a challenge to the difficult to publish in a respectable their own work. When research grants demonisation of saturated fats, this journal today, Furthermore, the follow- and publications are dependent on book should encourage us to challenge up time was short, and when longer the goodwill of reviewers, science that other so-called facts. term data were collected these did not challenges dogma can be stifted. support the hypothesis—but often Teicholz goes on to report that Stuart Spencer

Many readers will be incensed by this Part of the scientific process is health were also complicit in providing book, if you think saturated fats and rigorous peer review and debate. advice based on the weak science of a

a disquieting book about scientific "Researchers, clinicians, and of low-fat dets became established. reminds us about the It is important that people trust importance of good science and evidence.

professions that are trusted. In the After his heart attacks, US President increducous at some of Teichold's claims UKs 2016 tosos MORI Veracity Index, Dwight Eisenhower offered govern- and want to check the references. scientists were trusted by 80% of ment support for further scientific. When many of those papers are read the British public. Unfortunately, investigation into dietary fats and again from a more critical perspective, this might be changed by Teicholz's heart disease. Proponents of the link the angst and anger will rise. Teicholz expose that claims the public were between dietary fat and heart disease reminds us to critically question misled into thinking that high levels of were therefore in the ascendancy and research and, more importantly, detary saturated fats are the cause of obtained positions as government challenge unjustified extrapolation; advisers, as editorial board members, remember that associations do not Poor science was at the start of and on grant-giving bodies. From provide evidence of causality; and to the problem, claims Teicholz. The these powerful positions they largely be alert for misrepresentation and Big fat Surprise tells us that the diet-silenced critics by making it difficult non-reporting of inconvenient results. heart hypothesis was formulated and to publish papers that disagreed with Researchers, clinicians, and health promoted by Ancel Keys. He embarked their views. Furthermore, as Teicholz policy advisers should read this on an epidemiological study, the Seven documents, researchers who applied provocative book that reminds Countries Study, that aimed to identify for grants for research that might us about the importance of good a correlation between dietary saturated challenge the key opinion leaders science and the need to challenge fats and heart disease. The first in the fat debate had their grant dogma-especially when (with the published results of this study seemed applications rejected. Teichola reports best of intentions) agencies might to support the relation between fat that one grant applicant was told use scientific data to advocate societal intake and heart disease, but Teicholz "Your opposition to Keys is going to changes. The Big Fat Surprise also

these results were not published. agencies with the job of protecting stuart spenrenglancet.com

EAT

Parallels can be found in other dietary The Big fut Surprise and rubbes sincing of dissert frame read this provocative book that are unpresented as to be added to be added as the second as

narrative, but readers might be

tells us of bias in selecting countries cost you your grant." In science today shows that the quest for scientific and in selecting data (excluding it is still a criticism of peer review truth should not be subsumed to

Research Institute Thought leadership from Credit Suisse Research and the world's foremost experts

September 2015

CREDIT SUISSE



www.thelancet.com Vol 390 August 19, 2017

#2: Eating cholesterol does not worsen blood cholesterol





Cholesterol caps are gone

- Dropped by the American Heart Association in 2013
 - "Insufficient evidence"

- Dropped by the US Dietary Guidelines in 2015
 - "Cholesterol is no longer a nutrient of concern for overconsumption"

#3: The low-fat diet doesn't work

Tested in NIH-funded, randomized controlled clinical trials including the Women's Health Initiative and others.

On >65,000 men and women (mainly women)

Conclusions:

- The low-fat diet cannot be shown to be effective at fighting obesity, diabetes, heart disease, or any kind of cancer.
- These studies showed that the **low-fat diet** actually **increased heart-disease risk.**
- That is why there is **no longer** a "low-fat" diet recommendation.

#4: Fat does not cause cancer

Food, Nutrition, Physical Activity, and the Prevention of Cancer: a Global Perspective

American

nstitute fo

Cancer Research

Cancer

Research Fund

World Cancer Report 2007 No association between fat of any kind and cancer

There is no more "low-fat diet" recommendation

- Dropped by the American Heart Association
- US Dietary Guidelines started tip-toeing away from the "low-fat" diet starting in 2000



Path to Diabetes Consistent exposure to insulin over time



What is the evidence supporting this theory?

- More than 70 controlled clinical trials on nearly 7,000 people
- More than 32 trials 6 months or longer & 6 trials 2 years long
- Low-carb consistency leads to equal or more weight loss than low-fat
- Low-carb improves most cardiovascular risk factors

LATEST: Largest-ever study on T2 diabetics.
350+ subjects on a "ketogenic" diet.
1 year results: ~60% reversed their diabetes.



Increasing number of studies showing that full-fat dairy is good for health

Eur J Clin Nutr. 2017 Dec 11. doi: 10.1038/s41430-017-0042-5. [Epub ahead of print]

Effect of whole milk compared with skimmed milk on fasting blood lipids in healthy adults: a 3week randomized crossover study.

Engel S¹, Elhauge M², Tholstrup T².

Results Whole milk increased HDL cholesterol concentrations significantly compared to skimmed milk (P < 0.05). There were **no significant differences** between whole milk and skimmed milk **in effects on total and LDL cholesterol, triacylglycerol, insulin, and glucose concentrations**.

J Nutr. 2014 Jul;144(7):1081-90. doi: 10.3945/jn.113.183640. Epub 2014 Apr 17.

Dairy intakes at age 10 years do not adversely affect risk of excess adiposity at 13 years.

Bigornia SJ¹, LaValley MP², Moore LL³, Northstone K⁴, Emmett P⁴, Ness AR⁵, Newby PK⁶.

Children in the highest quartile of full-fat dairy intakes vs. those in the lowest quartile had a reduced risk of excess TBFM (total body fat mass)

How is full-fat dairy possibly good for you?

- 1. Saturated fats raise your HDL "good" cholesterol (and this is the only food known to do so) (cite research)
- 2. Many animal foods are highly nutritious *and those nutrients are most bioavailable*
- **3. Saturated fats are** *stable* and do not oxidize when heated: ideal for cooking
- 4. Fat and protein are satiating

State of Nutrition for Dairy

- No more caps on cholesterol (AHA, USDA Dietary Guidelines)
- Yet caps on saturated fat remain and are the reason for low-fat dairy, low demand for milk
- Competition from soy products



THE DANGERS OF DAIRY





In the 2015 **U.S.** Dietary Guidelines for Americans

Dairy

Healthy intake: Healthy eating patterns include fat-free and low-fat (1%) dairy, including milk, yogurt, cheese, or fortified soy beverages (commonly known as "soymilk"). Soy beverages fortified with calcium, vitamin A, and vitamin D, are included as part of the dairy group because they are similar to milk based on nutrient composition and in their use in meals. Other products sold as "milks" but made from plants (e.g., almond, rice, coconut, and hemp "milks") may contain calcium and be consumed as a source of calcium, but they are not included as part of the dairy group because their overall nutritional content is not similar to dairy milk and fortified soy beverages (soymilk). The recommended amounts of dairy in the Healthy U.S.-Style Pattern are based on age rather than calorie level and are 2 cup-equivalents per day for children ages 2 to 3 years, 2¹/₂ cup-equivalents per day for children ages 4 to 8 years, and 3 cup-equivalents per day for adolescents ages 9 to 18 years and for adults.

NUTRITION COALITION For evidence-based nutrition policy

A 501(C)(3) NON-PROFIT, NON-PARTISAN EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATION

Washington, D.C.


"Animal foods" include fish, meat, dairy, eggs, and animal fats; "Plant foods" include grains, fruits, vegetables, oils from plants, nuts, and added sugars. These are all the categories reported by the USDA in the ERS report (See source).

SOURCE: Jeanine Bentley. U.S. Trends in Food Availability and a Dietary Assessment of Loss-Adjusted Food Availability, 1970-2014, EIB-166, U.S. Department of Agriculture, Economic Research Service, January 2017; chart by Nina Teicholz.

U.S. Dietary Guidelines "Lack Scientific Rigor"



REPORT EXCERPTS:

"To develop a trustworthy DGA, the process needs to be redesigned."

"The current DGA process for reviewing the science falls short of meeting the best practices for conducting systematic reviews."

"Methodological approaches and scientific rigor for evaluating the scientific evidence need to be strengthened."

"The adoption and widespread translation of the DGA requires that they be universally viewed as valid, evidence-based, and free of bias and conflicts of interest to the extent possible. This has not routinely been the case."

"The methodological approaches to evaluating the scientific evidence require increased rigor to better meet current standards of practice."

The Nutrition Coalition

- A non-industry backed non-profit, non-partisan group dedicated to evidenced-based guidelines.
- We do not endorse any one diet. We simply want our national dietary policy to be based on rigorous science (i.e., controlled clinical trials and not epidemiological evidence)

The evidence-based issue for milk is saturated fat

DAIRY CONSUMPTION IN THE U.S.

1970-2014



NOTES: Consumption is calculated by the USDA from food availability, minus an estimation of food loss.

SOURCE: Jeanine Bentley. U.S. Trends in Food Availability and a Dietary Assessment of Loss Adjusted Food Availability, 1970-2014, EIB-166, U.S. Department of Agriculture, Economic Research Service, January 2017; chart by Nina Teicholz

- Last Dietary Guidelines Advisory Committee did not properly review the literature on saturated fat. (Teicholz, BMJ, 2015)
 - Never did a proper systematic review on saturated fats
 - No committee has EVER systematically reviewed any of the large, NIH-funded trials on saturated fats.
 - The committee rolled over the 10% cap on saturated fats without rigorous scientific review.



s with Inflammatory contract bowel disease r doctors CPD/CME hours hroscopy: Bisphosphonate ads differ and osteoporosis e UK? CPD/CME hours



NUTRITION

Lesson for the Next Dietary Guidelines Committee: We Need A Diversity of Opinion

October 17, 2018



www.nutritioncoalition.us

2015 Dietary Guidelines Advisory Committee:

A large majority (11 out of 14, or nearly 80%) had consistently published work in favor of plantbased, low-animal-fat, vegetarian diets, and that many had built their careers promoting these types of diets.

What can you do?

Selection of 2020-2025 Dietary Guidelines Committee is happening NOW

Secretary Perdue: Your Leadership Urgently Needed on Advisory Committee for Next Dietary Guidelines

January 18, 2019



www.nutritioncoalition.us

USDA will include of reviews of saturated fats and low-carb diets in the 2020 Guidelines

Thousands tell USDA: Update Guidelines to Reflect the Latest Science on Saturated Fat and Low-Carb Diets

April 4, 2018



The U.S. Department of Agriculture (USDA) heard from thousands of concerned citizens about the need to update the 2020-2025 U.S. Dietary Guidelines on topics where the science has evolved, particularly on saturated fats and low-carbohydrate diets.

Read More \rightarrow

What the letter asks for:

Secretary Perdue: Your Leadership Urgently Needed on Advisory Committee for Next Dietary Guidelines

January 18, 2019



By Dr. Dawn Lemanne, Dr. Mark Cucuzzella, and Dr. Jake Kushner

We have written an **urgent letter to Sonny Perdue**, Secretary of the U.S. Department of Agriculture, and we hope that you will consider joining us.

Read More →

www.nutritioncoalition.us

- Most importantly, an expert in evidencebased policy who knows how to evaluate science and who understands that controlled clinical trials should be prioritized over observational evidence.
- 2. An non-status-quo expert on saturated fats
- 3. An expert on lowcarbohydrate diets

Why This is so Important Now?

The future of change?

We cannot solve our problems with the same thinking we used when we created them.

The failure of the guidelines to combat nutrition-related diseases over the last 40 years is unacceptable.

The fact that these guidelines don't reflect the latest and most rigorous evidence is a travesty of science and a tragedy for public health.

Truth is a kind of justice, and we ask that this justice be served for the American people.







NYU

@bigfatsurprise
Nina Teicholz author page on Facebook
www.ninateicholz.com

f 🍠 G+ 🔊

NINATEICHOLZ home about nina works \sim media contact \sim blog fags o



Meet Nina Teicholz